AFFIRMATION OF BOARD VOTING RECORD

SUBJECT: H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition

Doc Control#2016-010

The Board, with Board Member(s) Jessie H. Roberson, Daniel J. Santos, Bruce Hamilton *approving,* Board Member(s) Joyce L. Connery, Sean Sullivan *disapproving,* Board Member(s) none *abstaining,* and Board Member(s) none *recusing,* have voted to approve the above document on December 14, 2015.

The votes were recorded as:

	APRVD	DISAPRVD	ABSTAIN	NOT PARTICIPATING*	COMMENT	DATE
Joyce L. Connery	☐	☒	☐	☐	☒	12/11/15
Jessie H. Roberson	☒	☐	☐	☐	☐	12/14/15
Sean Sullivan	☐	☒	☐	☐	☒	12/14/15
Daniel J. Santos	☒	☐	☐	☐	☐	12/14/15
Bruce Hamilton	☒	☐	☐	☐	☐	12/11/15

*Reason for Not Participating:

This Record contains a summary of voting on this matter together with the individual vote sheets, views and comments of the Board Members.

Executive Secretary to the Board

Attachments:
1. Voting Summary
2. Board Member Vote Sheets

cc: Board Members
OGC
OGM Records Officer
OTD

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Joyce L. Connery**

SUBJECT: **H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition**

Doc Control#2016-010

Approved_____ **Disapproved** ✓ **Abstain**_____

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below** ✓ **Attached**____ **None**_____

While I am confident in the technical accuracy in the staff issue report, I believe that this information has been appropriately conveyed to DOE and the Contractor and that they are taking steps to address identified issues. I believe the staff work done to date is sufficient to have moved DOE in the right direction and I commend the staff for their efforts

Joyce L Connery

Joyce L. Connery

Dec 11, 2015

Date

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Jessie H. Roberson**

SUBJECT: **H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition**

Doc Control#2016-010

Approved X **Disapproved**____ **Abstain**____

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below**___ **Attached**___ **None** X

Jessie H. Roberson

Jessie H. Roberson

December 14, 2015

Date

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Sean Sullivan**

SUBJECT: **H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition**

Doc Control#2016-010

Approved_____ **Disapproved__X__** **Abstain_____**

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below_X__** **Attached____** **None_____**

The staff performed a review of structural components at H-Canyon back in February, and provided their findings to DOE-SR at a review close-out in May. This letter and report, or at least a version of it, came to the Board in October. In November, DOE-SR directed SRNS to take core samples of the tunnel concrete. [redacted]

I understand that for several months DOE-SR and SRNS resisted taking core samples, believing as they did that the degraded (and still degrading) tunnel can perform its safety class function. I further understand that the sampling is estimated to cost a half-million dollars.

Our letter expresses a concern that the tunnel "may not be able to perform its safety class function," but appears satisfied that DOE-SR has directed additional sampling and analysis. Given all that we know about the integrity of the tunnel, I don't see why we can't reach one of two conclusions: either (a) the safety class function is necessary for adequate protection, and DOE lacks assurance of that function, or (b) the safety class function is not necessary for adequate protection and efforts to investigate further constitute improvements to safety subject to cost benefit analysis. If the former, I don't see why we would be satisfied with a sampling program that will take months, if not years, merely to tell us what we already suspect about the tunnel integrity. If the latter, I don't see why anyone should be satisfied with spending precious resources investigating a sixty year old tunnel. Either way, the DNFSB has taken almost a full year to get to where we are, and where we are doesn't make sense to me.

Sean Sullivan

12/14/15

Date

Lotus Smith

From: Daniel J. Santos
Sent: Monday, December 14, 2015 11:18 AM
To: Shelby Qualls; Lotus Smith
Subject: RE: Notational Vote: Doc#2016-010, H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition - BLUE FOLDER

Approved without comments.

From: Shelby Qualls
Sent: Friday, December 11, 2015 3:54 PM
To: Bruce Hamilton; Daniel J. Santos; Jessie Roberson; Joyce Connery; Sean Sullivan
Cc: Lotus Smith; Shelby Qualls; James Biggins
Subject: Notational Vote: Doc#2016-010, H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition - BLUE FOLDER

This email is an electronic record of Notational Vote. Voting ballot will follow shortly. Also, accepting electronic votes.

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD
NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: Members of the Board
SUBJECT: H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition

DOC#2016-010

Approved_____
Disapproved_____
Abstain_____
Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS:
Below____
Attached____
None____

Shelby Qualls
Assistant Executive Secretary
Office of the Chairman

DEFENSE NUCLEAR FACILITIES SAFETY BOARD

NOTATIONAL VOTE RESPONSE SHEET

FROM: **Bruce Hamilton**

SUBJECT: **H-Canyon Seismic Performance and Condition**

Doc Control#2016-010

Approved ✓ **Disapproved**_____ **Abstain**_____

Recusal – Not Participating_____

COMMENTS: **Below**___ **Attached**____ **None** ✓

Bruce Hamilton

Bruce Hamilton

11 DEC 2015

Date